Multilingual Documents of Medieval Sicily and Peasant Studies

Hiroshi Takayama

University of Tokyo, Professor of History
Institute for Advanced study, Willis F. Doney Member 2019-2020

Introduction

"peasants in medieval Sicily" , "What is *muls* in the Arabic documents?"
key words: "villein", "*muls*"

peasants in medieval Europe
  Marc Bloch, serf, villein

technical terms and documental words
  serf/ *servus*, villein/ *villanus*

I. Historiography: 19c.-21c. scholars and current state of research

1. studies of villeins in Norman Sicily
    R. Gregorio (1810), Noël des Vergers (1845), M. Amari (1854)
    F. Chalandon (1907), E. Mayer (1909), C. A. Garufi (1928)
    I. Peri (1965, 1993)
    G. Petralia (2006)

Figure 13.2   Words for villeins in three languages (Chalandon)

Latin
servi glebae, rustici, adscriptitii, inscriptitii, homines, coloni, aldii, metochii, cortisani, angararii, homines censiles

Greek
πάροικοι (*paroikoi*), ἄνθρωποι (*anthrōpoi*), ἐναπόγραφοι (*enapographoi*), ἐξώγραφοι (*exōgraphoi*)

Arabic
Rigiâl el Geraîd (= *rijāl al-jarā'id*), *Maks*, *Mehallet* (= *maḥallāt*), *Ghorebâ* (= *ghurabā'*)

(Chalandon, *Histoire de la domination normande*, vol. 2, p. 528)

2. two classes of villeins:

A law of William II concerning villeins prohibited from becoming clerics:

"Correcting by a benevolent interpretation the errors of those who say that without their lords' permission all villeins have been forbidden by royal constitution to enter the clergy, we decree that the villeins forbidden to become clerics by the above-mentioned constitution

should be those who are held to serve personally, i.e., with respect to their own persons, like *ascriptitii*, *servi glebe*, and others of that kind. However, those who must serve by reason of a holding or other benefice, if they desire to enter clergy, they may do so even without the accord of their lords, after they previously give back what they hold from their lords into the lords' hands."

"Errores eorum, qui villanos quoslibet sine licentia dominorum ad ordinem clericatus accedere regia constitutione dicunt esse prohibitum, interpretatione benivola corrigentes, decernimus eos tantum villanos predicta constitutione intelligi fore prohibitos clericari, qui personaliter, intuitu persone sue scilicet, servire tenentur, sicut sunt ascriptitii et servi glebe et huiusmodi alii. Qui vero respectu tenimenti vel alicuius beneficii servire debent, si voluerint ad ordinem clericatus accedere, liceat eis sine voluntate etiam dominorum, prius tamen hiis, que tenent a dominis suis, in eorum manibus resignatis." (Wolfgang Stürner, ed., *Die Konstitutionen Friedrichs II. für das Königreich Sizilien* (Hannover, 1996, MGH Const., 2, Suppl.), vol. 3-3, p. 366).

Figure 13.3   Classification of villeins by Chalandon

	villeins who owe service to their lords by reason of a holding (*ratione tenimenti*)	villeins who owe service to their lords with respect to their own persons (*intuitu personae*)
Latin	*homines censiles*	*servi* *adscriptitii*
Greek	ἐξώγραφοι (*exōgraphoi*) ἄνθρωποι (*anthrōpoi*)	ἐναπόγραφοι (*enapographoi*) πάροικοι (*paroikoi*),
Arabic	*maks* (*muls*) *Mehallêt* (= *maḥallāt*)	*rijāl al-jarā'id*

(Chalandon, *Histoire de la domination normande*, vol. 2, pp. 529-530)

3. recent studies of villeins by Arabists

- Annliese Nef, "Conquêtes et reconquêtes médiévales," *Mélanges de lÉcole française de Rome*, vol. 112/2 (2000)
- Jeremy Johns, *Arabic Administration in Norman Sicily* (Cambridge 2002)
- Alex Metcalfe, *Muslims and Christians* (London 2003)
- Adalgisa de Simone, "Ancora sui «villani» di Sicilia," *Mélanges de lÉcole française de Rome*, vol. 116 (2004)
- Alex Metcalfe, *The Muslims of Medieval Italy* (Edinburgh 2009)
- Annliese Nef, *Conquérir et gouverner la Sicile islamique aux XIe et XIIe siècles* (Rome 2011)

Jeremy Johns

muls and *ḥursh*: a pair of contrasted opposite terms

"the smooth man" in contrast to "the rough man"

Figure 13.4   Classification of villeins by Jeremy Johns

Registered	Unregistered
• *ahl* or *rijāl* (*iḍāfa* or preposition) *al-raḥl al-fulānī,* 'the people' or 'the men of such-and-such an estate'	
• *rijāl al-maḥallāt*, 'the men of the settlements'	• *al-ghurabā'*, 'the strangers'
• οἱ ἐντόποι (*oi entopoi*), 'the indigenes'	• οἱ ξένοι (*oi xenoi*), 'the strangers'
• *nativi*, 'indigenes'; *servi glebae*, 'serfs of the land'	• *advenae*, 'newcomers'; *hospites*, 'guests'
• *rijāl al-jarā'id*, 'the men of the registers'	
• οἱ ἐναπόγραφοι (*oi enapografoi*) 'the registered'	• οἱ ἐξώγραφοι (*oi exōgrafoi*), 'the unregistered'
• *adscriptitii*, 'the registered'	• *inscriptitii,* 'the unregistered'
• *al-ḥursh*, *al- rijāl al-ḥursh*, 'the rough', 'the rough men'	• *al-muls*, *al-rijāl al-muls*, 'the smooth', 'the smooth men'
• *rustici*, 'rough'	• [*glabri*, 'smooth']
• *qui personaliter, intuitu personae suae scilicet, servire tenentur,* 'those who are held to personal service, *i.e.* with respect to their own persons	• *qui ... respectu tenimenti vel alicuius beneficii servire tenentur,* 'those who ... owe service by reason of a holding or other benefice'

(Johns, *Arabic Administration*, p. 151, Table 6.1)

a framework from the 19th century

Reinhart Dozy, *Supplément aux dictionnaires arabes*, 2 vols. (Leiden, 1877–1881) , vol. 2, p. 620, املس, ملس:

"Les ملس formaient en Sicile une certain classe de serfs, tandis qu'une autre portait le nome de الحرش."

Carlo Alfonso Nallinos annotation to Amaris *Storia dei Musulmani di Sicilia*, 2nd ed. (1933-39, p. 246, note 1): ["La lettura del vocabolo è certamente *ḥurś* [=ḥursh] (plurale di *aḥraś* [=aḥrash]), che significa « ruvidi » (al tatto); è il contrapposte alla classe di persone dette *muls* «lisci», delle quali sarà detto più avanti, p. 250, nota 2 del revisore. Queste due denominazioni tecniche arabe non sono state fino ad oggi trovate fuori della Sicilia. L'esame dei diplomi porta all'equipollenza dei *ḥurś* [=ḥursh] ai *rigâl* [=rijāl] (od *ahl*) al- *gârâ'id* [=al-jarā'id] « uomini (iscritti) nelle platea », cioè ai *villani, adscripticii, rustici*.]

supporting sources

②1149, Arabic: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 14 [ed., Cusa, pp. 28-30; Johns & Metcalfe, pp. 242-248]

③1154, Arabic: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 16 [ed., Cusa, pp. 34-36; Johns & Metcalfe, pp. 248-253]

Figure 13.4

1149, line 6   **1154, lines 5-6**   "The total is five men (*rijāl*) from the district of Iato, among whom two are *ḥursh* and three *muls*."   الجملة خمسة رجال من إقليم جاطو منهم/ اثنين حرش وثلاثة ملس

II. Documents: What is *muls*?

1. What is *muls*?

sources including *muls*: five documents
    ①1141, Arabic: Toledo, ADM, Fond Mesina, no. 1119 [ed., Gálvez, 1991; Gálvez, 1995, pp. 171-181]
        muls
    ②1149, Arabic: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 14
        muls and *ḥursh*
    ③1154, Arabic: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 16 [ed., Cusa, pp. 34-36; Johns & Metcalfe, pp. 248-253]
        muls and *ḥursh*
    ④1169, Arabic-Greek: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 25 [ed., Cusa, pp. 37-39]
        ḥursh, *ghurabā'* and *muls*
    ⑤1183, Arabic-Greek: Palermo, BCRS, Fondo Monreale, no. 45 [ed., Cusa, pp. 245-286]
        muls = ἐξώγραφοι (*exōgraphoi*)

ἐξώγραφοι (*exōgraphoi*) : Greek translation of *muls*
    muls: "slipped" [from the former document or name-list]
    ἐξώγραφοι (*exōgraphoi*): "out of the written"[not included in the former document/namelist]
    not "the smooth man" in contrast to "the rough man" as some scholars have thought

muls and ἐξώγραφοι (*exōgraphoi*) in the document of ⑤1183
    See Readings, p. 18: Figure 13.7 Structure of the Document of 1183

muls in the document of ①1141
    See Readings, p. 6: Figure 13.8 Structure of the document of 1141

jarīda (pl. *jarā'id*)
    renewal of *jarā'id*, *rijāl al-jarā'id*

2. What is *ḥursh*?

Sources including *ḥursh*: three documents
    ②1149: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 14 (1st copy of a lost document of 1149)
        muls & *ḥursh*
    ③1154: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., Fondo Primo, no. 16 (2nd copy of the lost document of 1149
        muls & *ḥursh*
    ④1169: Palermo, Arch. Dioc., no. 25.
        ḥursh, *ghurabā'* & *muls*

ḥursh in the document of ④1169
    See Readings, p. 12: Figure 13.10 Structure of the document of 1169

Conclusion